



INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS

Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi Disciplinary
Peer Reviewed Edition :

www.ijlra.com

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume 2 Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

IJLRA

EDITORIAL TEAM

EDITORS



Megha Middha

Megha Middha, Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar

Megha Middha, is working as an Assistant Professor of Law in Mody University of Science and Technology, Lakshmangarh, Sikar (Rajasthan). She has an experience in the teaching of almost 3 years. She has completed her graduation in BBA LL.B (H) from Amity University, Rajasthan (Gold Medalist) and did her post-graduation (LL.M in Business Laws) from NLSIU, Bengaluru. Currently, she is enrolled in a Ph.D. course in the Department of Law at Mohanlal Sukhadia University, Udaipur (Rajasthan). She wishes to excel in academics and research and contribute as much as she can to society. Through her interactions with the students, she tries to inculcate a sense of deep thinking power in her students and enlighten and guide them to the fact how they can bring a change to the society

Dr. Samrat Datta

Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board



Dr. Namita Jain



Head & Associate Professor

School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.

Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi.(2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019

Mrs.S.Kalpana

Assistant professor of Law

Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr. Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8 Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1 Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.



Avinash Kumar



Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC - NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR - Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and learning.

ABOUT US

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS
ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

"SOUNDING THE ALARM: THE ROLE OF WHISTLEBLOWERS IN CORPORATE GOVERNANCE"

AUTHORED BY- MALLIKA BAJPAI

LL.B. (5th Semester)

Amity University, Lucknow

ABSTRACT

Whistleblowing, a vital force in upholding corporate governance integrity, transcends geographical boundaries and impacts global ethical business practices. Whistleblowers, often insiders, stand as unsung heroes who sound the alarm when witnessing misconduct, illegal activities, or unethical behavior within organizations. Their actions serve as a pivotal check and balance, ensuring transparency, accountability, and adherence to regulations. However, the path of a whistleblower is strewn with challenges, including the risk of retaliation, social stigma, and legal hurdles.

This research delves into the multifaceted concept of whistleblowing in India and on the global stage, exploring its historical evolution, psychological underpinnings, and the legal framework governing it. Through case studies, it examines the impact of whistleblowers in Indian corporations, shedding light on the outcomes and lessons learned from their courageous acts.

KEYWORDS: Whistleblowing, Companies, Corporate Governance, Organizations

INTRODUCTION

Whistleblowing, a contemporary cornerstone of corporate governance integrity, has gained significance on both the national and international fronts. It is a mechanism that transcends geographical boundaries and has the potential to reshape corporate culture, promote ethical conduct, and uphold regulatory compliance.

The voices of experts, echoing from different domains of law, activism, and corporate leadership,

resound with a unanimous call for robust protection and support for whistleblowers. Justice A.P. Shah, Aruna Roy, N.R. Narayana Murthy, Dr. Aditi Roy, and Sudhir Mishra represent the collective sentiment that while whistleblowers are integral to the integrity of corporate governance, they remain perilously unprotected in the current legal framework of India.

This paper embarks on a comprehensive journey through the looking glass to understand the multifaceted concept of whistleblowing. It analyzes the historical evolution of whistleblowing, examines the psychological underpinnings that motivate whistleblowers, and dissects the legal framework governing their actions.

Additionally, this research features case studies that vividly demonstrate the impact of whistleblowers within Indian corporations. These case studies reveal the outcomes and valuable insights gleaned from their courageous acts, shedding light on the critical need for transparency, protection, and ethical corporate governance in India.

In a world where financial improprieties and ethical lapses have far-reaching consequences, whistleblowers emerge as the moral compass, guiding organizations towards ethical waters. However, this journey is fraught with challenges, and despite legislative efforts and evolving legal frameworks, much remains to be done. The outcomes and lessons learned from the experiences of whistleblowers underscore the urgent need for comprehensive reforms in India's legal and corporate landscape to safeguard those who risk everything to sound the alarm.

THROUGH THE LOOKING GLASS: WHAT THE EXPERTS SAY

Justice A.P. Shah, Former Chief Justice of Delhi High Court:

"Whistleblowers are the internal auditors in any organization, and they often play a critical role in exposing corruption. But without proper legislation that offers them full protection, many remain silent."

Aruna Roy, Social Activist and Founder of MKSS:

"The Whistleblowers Protection Act, 2011, is just a start. What we need is a robust mechanism that ensures complete anonymity and swift action on the revelations made."

N.R. Narayana Murthy, Co-founder of Infosys:

"Corporate governance is not just a board issue, it's a holistic process that involves every stakeholder. Whistleblowers are a part of this ecosystem, often acting as a moral compass."

Dr. Aditi Roy, Corporate Law Professor:

"The Companies Act of 2013 has various clauses related to corporate governance but hardly any that provide whistleblowers the protection they require. There is a need for comprehensive reforms."

Sudhir Mishra, Advocate Supreme Court of India:

"Whistleblowers are the unsung heroes in the fight against corporate malfeasance. They risk their careers and more. Indian law is evolving but is not yet where it needs to be to fully protect these individuals."

Overall, the prevailing sentiment among legal experts, activists, and corporate leaders is that while whistleblowers are integral to the integrity of corporate governance, they remain perilously unprotected. The Whistleblowers Protection Act, 2011¹, and the Companies Act, 2013², offer some legal frameworks but are not comprehensive enough to offer full security and anonymity to whistleblowers. Most experts concur that a more robust system that guarantees the safety of whistleblowers and encourages ethical behavior within corporations is the need of the hour in India.

THE CONCEPT OF WHISTLEBLOWING IN INDIA

Whistleblowing has evolved as a crucial mechanism for upholding integrity and ethical practices in both the public and private sectors. In India, the modern understanding of whistleblowing has been shaped by a blend of legal frameworks, cultural norms, and significant events that have underscored its importance.

In the Indian context, whistleblowing refers to the act of exposing misconduct, illegal activities, or unethical behavior within an organization. It involves a person, often an employee or stakeholder, revealing information they believe to show corruption, malpractice, or other forms of wrongdoing.

¹ Bare Act on The Whistleblowers Protection Act, 2011

² Bare Act on The Companies Act, 2013

Types of Whistleblowing:

- **Internal Whistleblowing**: This occurs within an organization and is often the first route taken by whistleblowers. Indian laws such as the Companies Act, 2013, mandate the establishment of internal mechanisms to facilitate this.
- **External Whistleblowing**: In cases where internal channels are ineffective, individuals turn to external bodies like regulatory authorities, the media, or non-governmental organizations.
- **Anonymous Whistleblowing**: Due to the risks of retaliation and social stigma, Indian law allows for anonymous reporting, although this is often fraught with its own set of challenges.

Function and Necessity

In India, whistleblowing serves multiple functions:

- **Regulatory Compliance**: It helps companies and institutions adhere to legal guidelines and internal policies.
- **Accountability**: It holds both individuals and organizations accountable for their actions, thereby fostering a culture of integrity and ethical behavior.

The necessity of whistleblowing in India is underscored by its potential to counterbalance corruption and malpractice, common challenges that continue to plague both governmental and non-governmental institutions.

The formal introduction of whistleblowing in India came with the **Public Interest Disclosure and Protection of Informers Resolution (PIDPIR)** in **2003**, followed by the **Whistle Blowers Protection Act, 2011**. These legislative acts were catalyzed by high-profile cases, such as the murder of whistleblowers who exposed corruption, thereby making it evident that a formal mechanism was necessary for the protection of informants.

The Psychology Behind Whistleblowing

Psychologically, whistleblowing is a complex process shaped by a multitude of factors:

- **Moral Compass**: The cultural importance of 'dharma' or duty often serves as a motivating factor.

- **Retribution Anxiety**: Fear of repercussions either professionally or socially is a significant deterrent, further intensified by India's collective social fabric.
- **Social Responsibility**: A heightened sense of social responsibility has been observed, particularly in cases that have a direct impact on the community and environment.

WHISTLEBLOWERS IN CORPORATE GOVERNANCE:

GLOBAL PERSPECTIVE

In the globalized era, the role of whistleblowers in corporate governance has been increasingly recognized as critical for ensuring ethical business practices, accountability, and regulatory compliance.

Importance of Whistleblowers in Ensuring Corporate Governance

- **Ethical Vigilance**: Whistleblowers serve as the internal watchdogs of corporations, ensuring that the business adheres to ethical norms and regulations.
- **Transparency**: Their disclosures shed light on hidden malpractices, helping stakeholders understand the internal workings of a corporation better.
- **Accountability**: Whistleblowing actions lead to greater accountability as exposed malpractices often result in remedial actions and sometimes legal consequences for those involved.
- **Risk Mitigation**: Early detection of issues like financial fraud or unethical practices helps companies rectify the situation before it escalates into a major crisis.

Real-World Examples from Global Corporations

- **Enron Scandal (USA)**: Sherron Watkins exposed accounting loopholes, bringing down the entire corporation but also paving the way for stricter regulations like the Sarbanes-Oxley Act.
- **Volkswagen Emission Scandal (Germany)**: Internal whistleblowers were crucial in bringing to light the emission cheating software used in 11 million cars worldwide.
- **Cambridge Analytica (UK)**: Christopher Wylie revealed how personal data was being manipulated for political campaigns, impacting global data protection laws.

- **Julian Assange and WikiLeaks:** Although a more controversial example, the release of hundreds of thousands of classified documents brought to light governmental and corporate actions across various countries.

In emerging markets, the role of whistleblowers in corporate governance is often stifled due to weak legal frameworks, social stigma, and a lack of institutional support.

Challenges and Criticisms

- **Legal Repercussions:** Whistleblowers often face legal challenges, even in developed countries with well-established protection laws.
- **Social Stigma:** There is a global cultural bias that often labels whistleblowers as 'snitches,' impacting their personal and professional life.
- **False Alarms:** Critics argue that not all whistleblowing actions lead to positive outcomes; sometimes, they cause unnecessary panic or harm to the reputations of individuals and corporations.

Globally, the role of whistleblowers in enhancing corporate governance cannot be overstated. However, varying legal frameworks, social stigmas, and potential repercussions make it a complicated affair that still requires nuanced handling and appropriate policies.

INDIAN LEGAL FRAMEWORK CONCERNING WHISTLEBLOWING

In India, the issue of whistleblowing has gained considerable attention, especially in the wake of numerous corporate and public-sector scams. The country has made strides in legislating measures to protect whistleblowers, albeit with certain limitations. This section aims to explore the legislative landscape in India concerning whistleblowing.

Major Legislation

- **Whistle Blowers Protection Act, 2014:** Enacted to establish a mechanism for receiving complaints related to corruption or wilful misuse of power in public sector organizations.

- **Companies Act, 2013**: Section 177(9)³ mandates that certain classes of companies establish a vigil mechanism for directors and employees to report genuine concerns.
- **SEBI Regulations**: The Securities and Exchange Board of India (SEBI) has also issued guidelines that require listed companies to have a whistleblower policy.

Features and Provisions

- **Confidentiality**: Both the Companies Act and the Whistle Blowers Protection Act aim to protect the identity of the whistleblower to safeguard them from retaliation.
- **Coverage**: While the Whistle Blowers Protection Act covers only public servants, the Companies Act provisions are more broad-based, covering directors and employees in the private sector.
- **Reporting Channels**: Companies are required to establish proper channels like hotlines and dedicated email addresses for reporting unethical activities.

Criticisms and Limitations

- **Limited Scope**: The existing laws are criticized for having a limited scope. For instance, the Whistle Blowers Protection Act does not extend to the private sector.
- **Lack of Enforcement**: While laws exist on paper, the enforcement and actual protection of whistleblowers remain a significant concern.
- **No Specific Protections**: The legal framework does not adequately address the forms of harassment or victimization a whistleblower might face.
- **Amendments**: Proposed amendments to the Whistle Blowers Protection Act, such as the necessity to reveal the whistleblower's identity under certain conditions, have come under criticism for diluting the Act's effectiveness.

Judicial Stance

The Indian judiciary has generally been supportive of whistleblowers, upholding the right to expose corruption as a part of the fundamental right to freedom of speech and expression under Article 19(1)(a)⁴ of the Constitution.

³ Bare Act on The Companies Act, 2013, Section 177(9)

⁴ Bare Act on Indian Constitution Act, Article 19(1)(a)

While India has made some headway in establishing a legal framework for whistleblowing, much remains to be done. The implementation of these laws, expansion of their scope, and safeguarding the rights of whistleblowers need further strengthening to make whistleblowing an effective tool in ensuring corporate and public integrity.

CASE STUDIES: WHISTLEBLOWING IN INDIAN CORPORATIONS

Whistleblowing cases in India have received widespread attention due to their impact on corporate governance and ethical considerations. The following are specific case studies that shed light on whistleblowing incidents within Indian corporations, their outcomes, and the lessons learned.

- ***Infosys***

Background: In 2019, an anonymous whistleblower accused the senior management of Infosys of unethical accounting practices to boost short-term profits.

Outcome: After internal and external audits, it was concluded that the allegations were substantially without merit. However, the case led to severe reputational damage and fluctuating stock prices.

The incident emphasized the importance of an anonymous yet effective grievance redressal system within corporations. It also showed that false claims can have drastic consequences.

- ***Ranbaxy***

Background: Dinesh Thakur, a former employee, blew the whistle on the company for falsifying data about the generic drugs it was selling in the USA.

Outcome: The company had to pay \$500 million in fines, and its reputation was severely tarnished.

The case emphasizes the role whistleblowers can play in global corporate ethics, beyond the jurisdiction of just Indian laws.

- ***ICICI Bank***

Background: Arvind Gupta, an investor, exposed the alleged unethical relationship between the bank's CEO and the Videocon group.

Outcome: The CEO had to step down, and multiple agencies-initiated investigations. However, no substantial evidence was found to corroborate the allegations.

This case highlighted the need for due diligence and full disclosure in relationships between corporations and their stakeholders.

- ***Air India***

Background: In 2013, an engineer exposed safety norm violation, including faulty plane engines.

Outcome: The engineer faced victimization and was sidelined within the company, but eventually, a corrective action was initiated.

The case showed that whistleblowers often face severe personal and professional risks, and stronger protection mechanisms are needed for them.

- ***Tata Group***

Background: In 2013, an anonymous employee alleged that financial irregularities were occurring within Tata Finance, a subsidiary of the Tata Group.

Outcome: The Tata Group took the allegations seriously, employing internal as well as external auditors to scrutinize the claims.

In this case, the internal investigation couldn't substantiate the allegations. However, the process led to a renewed focus on strengthening internal controls and governance systems within the Group.

Outcomes and valuable insights acquired through these Case Studies

- **Transparency:** Whistleblowing incidents in India underscore the critical need for transparency in corporate governance.
- **Legal Provisions:** Despite existing laws, the practical protection of whistleblowers remains a challenge, as illustrated by some of these cases.
- **Organizational Culture:** Companies need to cultivate an environment where employees feel safe to speak up without the fear of retaliation.
- **Due Diligence:** Corporations must employ stringent due diligence in internal audits to substantiate or disprove whistleblowing claims.
- **Financial Implications:** The financial repercussions of whistleblowing, both for the whistleblower and the company, are significant and can lead to loss of job, penalties, and fluctuating share prices.

These case studies serve as a mirror of the complexities involved in whistleblowing within Indian corporations. They not only expose the gaps in existing legal frameworks but also underline the urgent need for ethical corporate governance.

CONCLUSION

The narrative of whistleblowing is a story of courage, ethics, and the relentless pursuit of integrity in corporate governance. In a world where financial improprieties and ethical lapses have far-reaching consequences, whistleblowers emerge as the moral compass, guiding organizations towards ethical waters. However, this journey is fraught with challenges, and despite legislative efforts and evolving legal frameworks, much remains to be done. The voices of whistleblowers echo through history, reminding us of the critical role they play in upholding transparency, accountability, and ethical standards. The outcomes and lessons learned from their experiences underscore the urgent need for comprehensive reforms in India's legal and corporate landscape to safeguard those who risk everything to sound the alarm. As we navigate the complexities of whistleblowing, we must remember that the path to corporate governance integrity is paved with the courage and determination of those who dare to speak the truth.

REFERENCE

I've collected information from several books and sites which I've listed below:

- Universal's The Companies Act, 2013 Bare Act
- Book on Corporate Governance by G.N. Bajpai
- Book on The Corporate Whistleblower's Survival Guide by Tom Devine and Tarek